

跨國女性研究通訊 第二期

最新消息

* 賀! “跨國女性研究” 整合計劃-經典研讀會十一月份場次, 圓滿落幕!

這一次的經典研讀會我們請到成大外文的陳健宏老師導讀 Kaplan Caren 的文章, 陳老師在導讀過程中提供了許多相關的研究議題, 也因此使經典研讀會內容更加的豐富及精彩。歡迎有興趣的同學到我們跨國女性研究計畫網站觀賞當天導讀情況!

* 賀! 十一月份專題演講 the Discourse and Narrative of Engendered girls: Waris Dirie's *Desert Serious* 成功結束

宜蘭大學外文系的游依琳主任, 在這次令人動容的演講中為我們講述跨國女性主義中的女孩敘述, 介紹來自東非的 Waris Dirie 在其三本著作中描述自身女性割禮經驗及成長過程。之後我們會將演講內容放在本網站上, 未來跨國女性研究計畫還會舉辦更多演講, 請大家密切注意相關演講消息。

* 性別學程設計工作坊將於 12/2 如期舉行, 歡迎大家共相盛舉。

本計畫的目的即在提供國內性別研究相關系所與研究中心負責人及學者(含研究生), 針對性別研究學程的現況和未來發展做一交流與討論, 進而探索資源整合的可能性。詳情請見網站說明。

* 經典研讀會第三場將於 12/7 在修齊大樓七樓會議室舉辦。

這次請到成大外文的賴俊雄老師來為我們導讀, 賴老師精於文學理論及哲學, 相信在賴老師的帶領下能讓我們對跨國女性這一個議題有深入的了解。當天我們備有點心飲料, 歡迎參加。

專書介紹

淺析「生物性別」與「文化性別」/ 成大外文系 陳健宏 老師

自從女性主義的聖經——西蒙·德·波娃 (Simone de Beauvoir, 1908-1986) 的《第二性》(*Le deuxième sexe*, t. I-II, 1949)(Beauvoir)——出版以來, 女性主義陳述 (feminist discourse) 大致可以歸結為三大探討途徑, 而分屬三大範疇: 一、廣義語言 (langage): 屬於表達方式 (expression) 的範疇, 最著名的例子也是這個途徑的濫觴就是西克蘇

(Hélène Cixous, 1938-)，這位英美文學學者在〈美杜莎之笑〉("Le Rire de la Méduse", 1975) 中首開先河提出「女性書寫」("écriture féminine") 的觀念(Cixous 39)。二、權力結構：屬於社會地位的範疇。三、身份 (identity)/主體性 (subjectivity)/性別意識 (sexuality)：屬於意識型態 (ideology) 的範疇。事實上，這三大探討途徑往往水乳交融、糾結交纏，以多面體的形式結晶呈現，同時女性主義問題體系 (problematic) 的核心就是性別 (gender)/性別意識。

性別/性別意識這個概念的根源可以追溯到美國心理醫生史托勒 (Robert J. Stoller, 1925-1991)，他的名著《生物性別與文化性別》(*Sex and Gender: The Development of Masculinity and Femininity*, 1968) 是日後相關問題的學理基礎。史托勒是美國心理分析學界的第三代，出生於紐約，哥倫比亞大學 (Columbia University) 畢業後定居西岸，獲得加州大學舊金山分校醫學博士，旋即執教於加州大學洛杉磯分校 (University of California, Los Angeles)，並且在該校創立文化性別研究診所 (Gender Identity Research Clinic)，咸認為第二次世界大戰之後研究性變態 (sexual perversion) 與變性 (transsexualism) 問題成就最高的學者。《生物性別與文化性別》享譽全球，使得史托勒與傅柯 (Michel Foucault, 1926-1984)、拉格 (Thomas Laqueur)、伊莉莎白·巴丹德 (Elisabeth Badinter, 1944-) 等人並列為性別意識發展這個領域中最傑出的專家。

史托勒從數百個病例當中觀察分析，得出結論：有別於解剖學鑑識而得知的生物性別 (sex) 之外，人類還有另一種基於社會文化認同的文化性別 (gender)；前者區分男性 (male)/女性 (female)，後者區分陽性 (masculine)/陰性 (feminine)；前者屬於身理範疇，後者屬於心理範疇(Stoller 9)。英文 gender 一詞源於拉丁文 genus (起源、出身、種族)，法國心理分析學界使用 sexualité 或 genre，而在佛洛伊德 (Sigmund Freud, 1856-1939) 筆下則是 Sexualität。

觀念	生物性別	文化性別
涵義	固有的生物特性	社會文化認同
類別	男性/女性	陽性/陰性
範疇	身理	心理

為了更精確理解所謂的「文化性別」，我們不妨先從心理分析的觀點瞭解一點背景知識。眾多心理分析詞典當中，解釋佛洛伊德學說 (Freudianism) 的首推拉普朗煦 (Jean Laplanche, 1924-) 與彭達利斯 (Jean-Bertrand Pontalis, 1924-) 合著的《心理分析詞彙》(*Vocabulaire de la psychanalyse*, 1967)(Laplanche et Pontalis)，已經有英譯；而以拉崗 (Jacques Lacan, 1901-1981) 學說 (lacanisme) 為主的則是佘摩摩 (Roland Chemama) 所編的《心理分析辭典》(*Dictionnaire de la psychanalyse*, 1995) 居冠(Chemama)，很遺憾至今尚無英譯。拉普朗煦與彭達利斯如此定義認同作用 (identification)：「心理過程，主體藉以吸收他者某個層面、某種固有特質、某種特性，然後以之為模範，整個或部份地改變自己。人格就是透過一系列的認同作用而形成並且具有特色。」("Processus psychologique par lequel un sujet assimile un aspect, une propriété, un attribut de l'autre et se

transforme, totalement ou partiellement, sur le modèle de celui-ci. La personnalité se constitue et se différencie par une série d'identifications."/"Psychological process whereby the subject assimilates an aspect, property or attribute of the other and is transformed, wholly or partially, after the model the other provides. It is by means of a series of identifications that the personality is constituted and specified."(Laplanche et Pontalis 187/205) 因此，認同作用涵蓋模仿對象與模仿作用二個層面，結果就是人格的形成。主體的文化性別深受教育、文化、社會影響，可以說是後天的建構，甚至有可能是權力結構運作的產物。史托勒在《生物性別與文化性別》一書中更進一步指出，文化性別並非一成不變，甚至會與生物性別大相逕庭，所以他提出了「核心文化性別」("core gender identity")(Stoller 29) 這個概念，由之衍生而出「變性」(Stoller 89-90) 現象：「一個人的文化性別變動不居，可以輕易甩掉，隨心所欲創造一個新的。」("One's gender identity is so unstable that it can be easily dispensed with and a new one created at will".)(Stoller 28)

史托勒的《生物性別與文化性別》之外，拉崗二〇〇七年十一月出版的《研討班十八：論不屬表象的一種陳述》(Séminaire XVIII: *D'un discours qui ne serait pas du semblant*, 1971)(Lacan 2006) 提供了另一種思維角度。拉崗的著作出版是法國學術界的大事，早在二〇〇六年就宣佈付梓的《研討班十八：論不屬表象的一種陳述》，千呼萬喚，比版權頁標示的出版時間晚了整整一年終於上市。拉崗的著作當中對男/女性別意識著墨比較多的就是《研討班十八：論不屬表象的一種陳述》，一九七一年一月二十日第二堂課上，他極力向學生推薦史托勒的《生物性別與文化性別》，要求他們仔細研讀(Lacan 31)，而他所說的一段話值得細細品味：

性別認同不在於認為自己是男人或者女人，而是在於男生要考慮到女人的存在，女生要考慮到男人的存在。而且，重要的甚至倒不是他們的感受，容許我這麼說，這是現實狀況。事實就是，女生對男人而言是陽具，加以閹割；男生對女人而言也是陽具，加以閹割，因為她們先天沒有陰莖，沒有能夠擁有。一開始，男生、女生所冒的唯一風險在於他們自己所發動的慘劇，他們有那麼一個片刻是陽具。

("L'identification sexuelle ne consiste pas à se croire homme ou femme, mais à tenir compte de ce qu'il y ait des femmes, pour le garçon, qu'il y ait des hommes, pour la fille. Et ce qui importe n'est même pas tellement ce qu'ils éprouvent, c'est une situation réelle, permettez-moi. C'est que pour les hommes, la fille, c'est le phallus, et que c'est ce qui les châtre. Pour les femmes, le garçon, c'est la même chose, le phallus, et c'est ça qui les châtre aussi, parce qu'elles n'acquièrent qu'un pénis, et que c'est raté. Le garçon ni la fille d'abord ne courent de risque que par les drames qu'ils déclenchent, ils ont le phallus pendant un moment.") (Lacan 34)

《研討班十八：論不屬表象的一種陳述》裏，拉崗講述的重點就是日後紀傑克 (Slavoj Žižek, 1949-) 最愛談論的現實界 (le réel/the real)：「對一位主體而言，象徵界介入而予以逐出現實的種種」("Ce que l'intervention du symbolique pour un sujet expulse de la réalité").(Chemama 278)。拉崗的心理分析拓樸學 (topologie) 中現實界、象徵界、想像界 (l'imaginaire) 三個範疇交互辯證，而另一方面與感知結果「表象」(le semblant) 吻合的

現實界，始終如一地重返主體的心理世界 (psyché/psyche)，轉化成為象徵界的主宰符徵 (signifiant maître/master signifier) Φ ，最後促成主體的性別認同。拉崗的說法印證了二十世紀法國哲學思維的特色——「反面」(négativité/negativity) 辯證(Descombes 36)：同由異加以界定，自我由他者加以界定，♂/♀由♀/♂加以界定。

參 考 書 目

- Beauvoir, Simone de. *Le Deuxième sexe*, t. I-II. Paris: Gallimard, 1949.
- Chemama, Roland, dir. *Dictionnaire de la psychanalyse*. Nouvelle édition revue et augmentée. Paris: Larousse, 1995.
- Cixous, Hélène. "Le Rire de la Méduse." *L'Arc* 61 (1975): 39-54.
- Descombes, Vincent. *Le Même et l'autre: quarante-cinq ans de philosophie française (1933-1978)*. Paris: Minuit, 1979.
- Lacan, Jacques. *Le Séminaire, livre XVIII, D'un discours qui ne serait pas du semblant*(1971). Texte établi par Jacques-Alain Miller. Paris: Le Seuil, 2006.
- Laplanche, Jean. et Pontalis, Jean-Bertrand. *Vocabulaire de la psychanalyse*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1967.
- (E. t: Jean Laplanche and Jean-Bertrand Pontalis. *The Language of Psycho-analysis*. Trans. Donald Nicholson-Smith. London: The Hogarth Press and the Institute of Psycho-analysis, 1973.)
- Stoller, Robert J. *Sex and Gender: The Development of Masculinity and Femininity*. London: Karnac, 1974 (1st edition: 1968).

老師專欄

歡欣鼓舞一個學術社群的成立——在成大外文系/ 成大外文系 劉開玲老師

「風簷展書讀，古道照顏色」。每逢看到人專心地看著書時，腦中總會浮現這兩句話，和伴隨著這兩句話而起的寧靜喜悅的感覺。古代雖有私塾、書院，但印象中的古人，總是寒窗苦讀，盼著金榜題名，升官發財。現代人可就不同了。雖然和古人一樣，也得苦讀，但是卻得一個人抗拒萬般紅塵俗事的騷擾與誘惑，狠下心無視親朋好友的呼喚，只為了成就一篇論文，這種內外相煎的壓力，人和人之間的競爭任人怎麼也無法喜悅起來。學術的生活就只能這樣殘忍嗎？記得好些年前，系上來了一群好夥伴，大家開始聚會，輪流分享各自進行的研究、組成 Judith Butler 的讀書會，傅柯的讀書會，藉由一個學術社群彼此相互切磋鼓勵，一路走來，輕鬆許多。不過曾幾何時，聚會成了系務會議的延

伸，儘管這樣的討論也有它的重要性，那種心靈上的溝通和交流卻少了許多。現在有了素玲這個「跨國女性研究」的讀書會，非常有組織地帶動（逼迫？）大家閱讀討論，參與的不只是系上的好友，還有好多系上的同學，好多跨校的師生。一個人孤寂的研讀可以成為聚會時光熱的討論，多好啊！期望這個社群的永續經營，期望這個社群帶動更多的社群！從此不寂寞。

The Reception of Virginia Woolf in Taiwan /師大翻譯所 李根芳老師

Virginia Woolf with her great talent as a writer and thinker stands high on the plateau of literary achievements. There is no doubt that she is one of the most distinguished modernist writers in the twentieth century. Poetic impressionism and indirect narration contribute to her innovative skills as a writer. In the meantime, her concerns about women's status and women writers' potentials also inspire many feminists onwards. Does her work, after being translated into Chinese, also influence her Chinese readers in Taiwan in the same way as its original to her English readers?

According to Itamar Even-Zohar, translated literature maintains a central position in the literary polysystem. He suggests that it participates actively in shaping the center of the polysystem. When Virginia Woolf was first introduced to Taiwan's readers in 1960, her works were indeed seen as a stimulus to the then literary production. Not until 1990s are her works translated into Chinese in a larger scale and more acknowledged by Taiwan's readership, yet only a certain novels are translated and in some cases, one novel has three or four different translations. Why are the delay and the repetition? Do her works also influence other systems beside literary production?

My research project aims to examine the reception of her translated works in Taiwan and explore the ways in which Woolf's various identities (as a fiction writer, reviewer, feminist, critic, pacifist and so on) are represented in Taiwan. For the past decades, she is probably most well-known for her concerns about gender equality and her extensive and dexterous usage of the stream of consciousness in her novels. Her fame reached its peak in Taiwan especially after the film *The Hours* was shown in 2003. Superstar Nicole Kidman played the writer in this film, which made a lot of audience took interest in who she is. The fact that many heated discussions and queries of her on the websites appeared at the time can be a proof of her newly gained popularity in Taiwan. No wonder the critic, Catharine R. Stimpson suggests, 'given the age of spectacle and image in which we live, many people "see" Woolf before they read her' (xiii).

Due to the scope of this research, I will focus on Woolf's own works and attempt to investigate how her works are translated or NOT translated and to what ends. I'd like to ask the following questions: How her images as a novelist, essayist, critic, sapphist and feminist are evoked at different stages of dissemination of her works? Why some of her works are never translated and some of them have three or four translations? What triggers the

transformations of her image and what effects such transformation may have on readers of her translated works? Further, I'll try to apply Even-Zohar's polysystem theory to examine how Virginia Woolf's translated works influences Taiwan's literary and cultural productions and how Taiwan's readers read and understand Woolf's works.

Beyond the Imaginary Relationship Between Western Feminists and Third-World Women /
成大外文系 游素玲老師

This study reveals a postcolonial desire not only to redraw the boundary between Western and Third-World women, but also to investigate the imaginary relationship, or rather, the psychological dynamics involved in Western women's relationship with Third-World women. Rather than reduce the relationship between Western women and Third-World women to simple opposition, it attempts to understand the ambivalence in their relationship. The study is driven by my desire to understand how Western feminists seek to identify with Third-World women, and how this can contribute to an understanding of postcolonial power relations and move beyond the assumed polarities of identity politics. I want to be able to think beyond a simple binary analysis of culpability and innocence toward an understanding of how differences among women can be seen as enriching and valuable.

This study is also a response to the psychoanalytic feminists' call for integrating race into psychoanalytic discourse. In fact, feminist psychoanalysis lacks a model to investigate "Third-World women." Despite the increased attention of psychoanalytic feminists to the complicated psychological relationship between white and black women in the United States, Western feminists disregard their relationship with non-Western women in their psychoanalytic discourse. Both Western feminists and Third-World feminists need to recognize that fantasy and desire, as unconscious processes, play a fundamental role in our imaginary relationships. Without attempting a complete analytical model, my study will offer suggestions for psychoanalytic feminist analysis of the relationship between the Western and Third-World woman.

研究生專欄

*Saving an Author from Drowning: Amy Tan's Transition from an Ethnic writer to a Global writer/*成大外文所 江欣珍

With the publication of her fifth novel, *Saving Fish from Drowning* (2005), famous Asian American writer Amy Tan makes a shift from her familiar theme to a brand-new one—globalization and its impact on modern people. This thesis proposes to explore her transition from an ethnic writer to a "global writer," whose writing tends to concentrate on

issues related to globalization and its impact to the world as well as her own attitude toward globalization. The first part of the thesis—Chapter One would point out several possible factors related to her transition, including the essential change in both her personal life and external socio-historical circumstance. In terms of her personal life, I refer to the death of her mother which proclaims the end of her Chinese inspiration coupled with Lyme disease which reminds her to sympathize the suffering of people all around the world. As for external socio-historical circumstance, I focus on how her ethnic identity leads to the public's limited interpretations such as the highlight of "(im) political correct" representation of China in her writing. To get rid of biased reading of her works, Tan turns to new subjects, and the similarity between *Saving Fish* and other "global novels" implies her new identity as a global writer. Also, to clarify the emergence of global novel in the era of globalization and its content, I list opinions from numerous theorists who notice this novel genre.

The second part—Chapter Two and Three illustrate Tan's comment on the respective influence of global media and transnational tourism on the First World as well as the Third World respectively. To delineate Tan's attitude toward globalization, I adopt Jean Baudrillard's concept of simulation, for both of them concentrate on the manipulation of the media. Chapter Two discusses not only how the prosperity of global media and transnational tourism shortens the distance between different regions but how the First World people indulge in the simulation generated by global media, relying on it to construct their perspective on the Third World and the world they exist likewise. Chapter Three involves Tan's concern on the impact of global media and transnational tourism on the economic-social circumstance of Burma and Baudrillard's criticism on ethnology and reality show serves as a comparison to her discussion on local tribe Karen people, disclosing the ambiguity of global media. In conclusion, through redefining herself as a global writer, Amy Tan embraces diverse issues other than China and is no longer "drowned" in limited interpretations.

第二場經典研讀會感想 / 成大外文所 劉彥良

火花乍現！

不得不承認，印象最深刻的一幕是某位女性提問者「相當程度」地不滿男性主講人給予的回應。這一幕深深地印在腦海裡，也激起了一些關於女性議題上的思慮。

這樣的「緊張情勢」是再次證明了男女之間始終存在的那道隔閡呢？還是讓這場研讀會不攻自破地加深理論與實現/現實間所不能跨越的鴻溝呢？似乎這場研讀會給了我們機會去了解跨國女性研究者所開啟的新方向，但也同時讓我們看見它那無終局似的不確定性。

而此不確定性則由兩位學者間的火花間蔓延開來。

男女大不同，就算是第三世界的男女也一樣。在我們專注於關懷非西方世界的女性時，要如何地發展出「一套」論述來探討全世界那成千、成百種不同地域間的性別分野與其民情風俗？在第三波女性主義者放眼於當代女性間所存在的種種差異性及獨特性的同時，跨國女性研究者是否會掉入將第三世界女性「概括化」的循環？如果真要強調不同地域女性間的不同論述的話，那我們要發展出「幾套」理論才能達成跨國女性研究者理想中的終點？亦或是，根本就沒有終點？在看似追尋不可能的研究之中，除了人道關懷以及紙上盤演以外，身為「文本閱讀」的我們，要「捨身處地」地為其他世界的女性著想，還似乎真有那麼一段距離。身為男性的我，那道距離似乎又更遠了不止一點。

至於實踐的層面，不禁想問，如果我連我媽媽、我妹妹、我阿媽都無法讓她們實質了解所謂的女性主義，那我們又該如何奢望我們可以跨國地「散播大愛」呢？之前電視上曾播過一些節目，關於伊斯蘭世界女性所承受的種種不公。在節目尾聲，螢幕上出現一個網址，希望想幫忙的各國人士能夠去瀏覽一下。而我登入之後，能幫上的忙只有一個選擇：捐錢資助婦女團體，還必須用信用卡刷。對於正在接觸性別領域的我，網頁上的選擇真是讓我覺得又諷刺又好笑。不知我們能否將此研究通訊翻成伊斯蘭文，然後在當地出版，這或許更能直接衝擊其他國家對於男女平等議題的重視。

性別研究的課題自始至終都是一個金鎖，它有它的價值，且一直守護著理想者的珍寶。但在數百個世紀之後，解謎的鑰匙仍被眾人尋覓之中。在整個過程裡，試圖把鎖敲開而產生的火花不勝枚舉。有人選擇閃避被火花傷害的危險，有人選擇珍惜火花所照亮的那一部份，更有人一輩子不曾見過火花的光亮。但是，不知所有接近鎖的人是否都著有相同的疑慮，那就是：那把鑰匙，到底存不存在？

火花似乎不曾停歇，在心裡蔓延著。